
JUSTIFICATION STATEMENT FOR CONTRACT AWARD

Division of Alcoholic Beverage Control
New Tooele Liquor Store
DFCM Project No. 02037030

The Tooele Store selection committee was impressed with each of the Contractors and expresses its appreciation to them for their efforts and interest in the project. Please note, as stated in the Stage 2 RFP, the Selection Committee reserved the option to revise their scores for the previously scored criteria of Stage 1, and in some cases, the Committee did revise the scores.

The Committee resolved to rank Valley Design & Construction (Valley) the best value firm due to the following:

- They submitted an excellent management plan that explained in detail the project risks and how they would be eliminated or mitigated. Valley's critical team members had all visited the site and demonstrated an in-depth understanding of the site and project.
- Valley proposed a completion date prior to the RFP's scheduled completion date and adequately illustrated that they could meet their proposed timeline.
- The firm did an excellent job of evaluating and selecting their subcontractors. Although they had not previously worked with one critical sub, Valley offered to bond the sub at no additional cost to the Owner.
- Valley submitted a competitive price for both the base bid and the add alternate.
- The firm offered several value-added and cost savings options.

Although there were essentially two cost proposals lower than Valley's, the Selection Committee determined that Valley's aggressive schedule, value added options, experience, and strength of team offset the difference in cost and as such, is the best value for the project.

Final Ranking

1. P
2. N
3. K
4. I
5. D
6. R
7. U

VBS Short Listing Final Scoring Matrix

Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control
New Tooele Liquor Store
DFCM Project No. 02037030

25 November 2003

Selection Criteria	D					R					I					N				
Past Performance	4.5	4.8	4.7	4.5	3.5	4	4	4	4.5	3.8	4.5	5	5	5	4	4.5	4.2	4.7	4	4.5
Project Management Approach	3.5	4	3.5	3	4.6	3	4	3.5	3	3.5	5	4	4.5	4.8	5	3.5	5	4.5	4	4.6
Schedule	3.5	5	4	3.5	4.5	3	5	3	3	3.9	4	4	4	4.5	4.8	4	5	5	4	4.5
Strength of the Contractor/Firm	4	4	4	3.5	3.5	4.5	4	4	3	3.4	4	4.5	4.5	3	4	4.5	4	4.5	3.5	4.5
Strength of the Project Manager	4.5	4	4	3.5	3	4	3	4	3	3.8	4.8	4.5	4.5	3.5	4.8	4.5	3.5	4.5	4	4.5
Strength of the Site Superintendent	4	4	4	3	3	4.5	3	4	3.5	3.4	5	4.5	4.5	4.8	5	4	4	4	4	4

Selection Criteria	K					U					P				
Past Performance	4.5	5	5	5	4.8	4	4	5	4.5	3.6	4	5	4	4.5	4
Project Management Approach	3.5	4	4.5	3	4	3	4	3	2	2	4	5	4.5	4.8	5
Schedule	3.5	5	4	3.5	4	3	4	2	3	2	4	5	4.5	4.5	5
Strength of the Contractor/Firm	4.5	5	4.5	3	5	3	4.5	4	3	3.6	4.5	4.5	4.5	3	4
Strength of the Project Manager	4.5	5	4	3.5	4	4	4	4	3	3	4.5	4.5	4.5	3.5	4.9
Strength of the Site Superintendent	4.5	5	4.5	3	3.8	3.5	3.4	3	2	3	4.5	4.5	4.5	4.8	5

**DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
DIVISION OF FACILITIES CONSTRUCTION AND MANAGEMENT**

VALUE BASED SELECTION

PROPOSALS COVERING:

DATE: November 13, 2003

NEW TOOELE LIQUOR STORE
DEPT OF ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGE CONTROL
TOOELE, UTAH

DFCM Project No: 02037030
Construction Budget: \$925,000

CONTRACTOR	BID SEC	ADD RECD	BASE BID	ADDIT ALT 1	TOTAL BID	SUBLIST RECD	COMPL DATE
D	BB	1-6	\$903,700	\$11,000	\$914,700	Yes	6/18/04
R	BB	1-6	869,000	11,000	880,000	Yes	6/18/04
I	BB	1-6	924,775	10,800	935,575	Yes	-
N	BB	1-6	909,000	10,800	919,800	Yes	-
K	BB	1-6	906,000	10,000	916,000	Yes	6/18/04
U	BB	1-6	875,954	10,900	886,854	Yes	-
P	BB	1-6	904,000	11,000	915,000	Yes	6/18/04

I hereby certify this to be a true and exact tabulation of proposals
received for the above named project on November 13, 2003 at 3:00 p.m.

Susan L. Smith
Contract Coordinator